

This search committee is composed of three full professors and one untenured Assistant Professor in a Computer Science and Engineering department. Three are male, and one is female; the three males are European American and the woman is African American. They are considering four final candidates for an open tenure-track position in their department. They must choose two candidates for a final list that will be voted on at the next faculty meeting. Three of the candidates are male, one is female; two of the male candidates are European American, the other is Mexican American; the female candidate is European American.

Faculty

Professor Christian Breaker
Professor Patricia Skye
Assistant Professor Don Taylor
Committee Chair John Danson

Final Candidates:

Angela
Raúl
Roger
Aaron

Professor Christian Breaker:

For the most part these candidates are strong, but I have reservations about Raúl and Alison or whatever her name is.

Committee Chair John Danson:
Angela. What are your reservations?

Professor Christian Breaker:

Well, first of all, Angela is the only one without a PhD from Carnegie Mellon or MIT. She seemed nervous during her job talk too. Let's drop her and go with the best. Secondly, Raúl has the right school on his CV but 2 of his 5 published papers are on social issues, not computer science and engineering.

Professor Patricia Skye:

Those papers relate directly to CSE and discuss the experiences of underrepresented groups in computer science. I consider those papers an asset to his candidacy. Angela's alma mater has a strong program, she has impeccable evaluations from some of the top specialists in the field and she has received recognition for her teaching. Finally, we decided that this meeting would focus on discussing all candidates' qualifications before making any decisions. Let's consider all angles.

Committee Chair John Danson:

I agree. Let's go through the criteria we came up with last meeting and rate each candidate. We need to report out on our process at the faculty meeting on Friday. Who will fit best with our department's needs?

Professor Christian Breaker:

Bruce's retirement has left us with a need for someone in Graphics and Animation - Aaron's a perfect replacement. He received positive evaluations on his Graphics and

Animation class at MIT and I hear his work in automated video segmentation is original! I know, because he trained with Jim Mayflower at Carnegie Mellon who is a good friend of mine.

Committee Chair John Danson:

Teaching a class does not make one a specialist. I once taught Advanced Operating Systems for Pete's sake. I do like that he has experience, though I find Roger's work in Human-Computer Interaction to be more cutting-edge. We need to invest in someone in an up-and-coming area who can help attract top graduate students.

Professor Patricia Skye:

This is *not* a meeting of the old boys club – we're supposed to be doing what's best for the department.

Professor Christian Breaker:

This feels more like a meeting of the drama club! For the record, I am looking out for this department! We need computer scientists in this department doing hard-hitting research. Graphics are where the industry dollars are at! I think Aaron will fit in easily here. Don, what do you think?

Assistant Professor Don Taylor:

Aaron's solid. I don't think any of the other candidates already has another offer like he does. We have to move quickly on this one. Plus, he got a MIT TR35.

Committee Chair John Danson:

Don, we didn't decide to make competitive offers an evaluation criterion. The TR35 though is very impressive. I saw his research touted as the latest and greatest in video-game play. Does this reflect our priorities? I'm also impressed by Raúl's ACM Doctoral Dissertation Award and by the fact Angela is a co-PI of a collaborative grant with UC Berkeley to broaden participation in computing. I keep hearing about that project.

Assistant Professor Don Taylor:

We need hire a candidate who does science, not social work.

Professor Patricia Skye (*taking a deep breath*):

Angela's focus on game theory and mechanism design has lead to her to study the social application of computing. She has the most publications on her CV, including one in *Science*. Besides, we need another woman in this department. I've been the only one since Charlotte left four years ago. When is the last time we hired...

Professor Christian Breaker:

Look Pat, this committee here needs to set the tone and standard for this department, showing that we hire only the best of the best. We need someone with old-fashioned technical ability who can help us build up our national ranking. I'm talking about quality here, not some quota system.

Assistant Professor Don Taylor:

I agree. No one is as good as Aaron. The rest of the faculty will see that. Who else should we include in the final list? Raúl's theoretical work is just so different from what we usually do around here and Angela holds no interest for me at all.

Committee Chair John Danson:

Didn't you co-author a paper with Aaron?

Assistant Professor Don Taylor:

Yeah, the guy's a rising star.

Professor Patricia Skye:

Did the article appear in *Science* like Angela's?

Assistant Professor Don Taylor:

No.

Professor Patricia Skye:

Nor is he the lead author on any of his publications, unlike all of the other candidates. John, please note these facts in the candidate rubric.

Professor Christian Breaker:

Your affirmative action agenda is so obvious! Why else would you nit-pick away at the person who is most qualified?

Committee Chair John Danson:

Chris, that's not fair. All candidates' strengths and weaknesses have to be discussed. And just because Aaron is your favorite doesn't mean he's the best.

Assistant Professor Don Taylor:

Alright, come on, let's decide who else we are recommending to the faculty on Friday.

Committee Chair John Danson:

We haven't decided on *anyone* yet. Let's rank the candidates based on the five areas. What do you think of the candidates' teaching statements?

Professor Patricia Skye:

I think the vote on Friday should be blind to protect the untenured faculty.

